At all levels of education, teachers are at the very heart of the efforts made to establish the common foundations for the acquisition of skills, knowledge, lifelong learning, culture, respect for constructive achievements and regard for codes of conduct that are essential for the economic, social and cultural progress of society. In so many respects, the future of the world is in the hands of teachers.

Ms Anne-Lise Høstmark Tarrou,
Chairperson,
CEART. 2006
Status of Teachers in Pakistan 2008
Status of Teachers in Pakistan 2008. Lahore: UNESCO/USAID & ITA
Lahore, 2008.
36 p.

© UNESCO/USAID & ITA 2008

Published by
Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi
67-A, Abid Majeed Road,
Lahore Cantt., Pakistan

Printed by
Chaudhry Sons, Lahore.

This report on the Status of Teachers is made possible by the support of the American People through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The contents of this report are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID, the United States Government, UNESCO or ITA.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIOU</td>
<td>Allama Iqbal Open University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJK</td>
<td>Azad Jammu and Kashmir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AKES</td>
<td>Agha Khan Education Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AKU-IED</td>
<td>Agha Khan University - Institute of Educational Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPS</td>
<td>Basic Pay Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEART</td>
<td>Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations Concerning Teaching Personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIDA</td>
<td>Canadian International Development Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRPRID</td>
<td>Center for Research on Poverty Reduction and Income Distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CT B.Ed</td>
<td>Certificate of Training Bachelors of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTSC</td>
<td>District Teacher Support Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDO</td>
<td>Executive District Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Education for All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FANA</td>
<td>Federally Administered Northern Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>Federally Administered Tribal Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTZ</td>
<td>Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEC</td>
<td>Higher Education Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIEP</td>
<td>International Institute of Education Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INGO</td>
<td>International Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITA</td>
<td>Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KCP</td>
<td>Knowledge for Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KZR</td>
<td>Kudos, Zeal, Renewal (company)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTBF</td>
<td>Medium Term Budgetary Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTDF</td>
<td>Medium Term Development Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEC</td>
<td>National Education Census</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPR</td>
<td>National Education Policy Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFBE</td>
<td>Non-Formal Basic Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>National Plan of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>North West Frontier Province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSI</td>
<td>Open Society Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEF</td>
<td>Punjab Education Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PITE</td>
<td>Provincial Institute of Teacher Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRSP</td>
<td>Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAHE</td>
<td>Society for the Advancement of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNE</td>
<td>Schedule of New Expenditure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>Teacher Resource Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UIS</td>
<td>UNESCO Institute of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children's Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UPE</td>
<td>Universal Primary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VSO</td>
<td>Voluntary Services Overseas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTD</td>
<td>World Teachers’ Day</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We dedicate this work to the daily teaching-learning encounters of over 1.4 million teachers of Pakistan, who work across different levels of formal and non-formal delivery systems, in both the public and private sectors. We hope that this work will inspire them to reflect, review and rediscover their status as the primary social engineers of the 21st century.

At the outset, we would like to acknowledge the valuable work done by many institutions, both national and international, which have informed this secondary research study. This booklet is based on the very significant work undertaken by many agencies that have been engaged in examining the role of teachers as the main drivers for achieving educational quality. These include: the Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, Provincial Departments of Education, AEPAM, UNESCO, USAID, OECD, DFID, ILO, UNICEF, CEF, SC UK, VSO and national NGOs and research institutions. Their outputs have been rich sources of information, data and in-depth cutting-edge research on the subject of teacher influence on educational quality. The recommendations provided in the last section of this booklet are compiled from studies by UNESCO/USAID, the National Education Policy and World Teachers Day research conducted by Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi (ITA).

We would also like to particularly acknowledge the lead role of UNESCO as a strategic investor in upgrading the body of knowledge on education issues, as well as for its commitment to sector-wide and rights-based approaches. The guidance provided throughout the research was most useful. We would particularly like to thank Mr. Ichiro Miyazawa and his team in Islamabad, Pakistan, for supporting this initiative.

Finally we would like to thank the research team at ITA: Rabia Nusrat, Amima Sayed, Parveen Roy & Talha Shahzad, who facilitated the principal researcher, Baela Raza Jamil, Chairperson ITA, to collect and analyse data, and map evidence on the shifting trends in re-conceptualizing educational provision and the status of teachers. We are also grateful to the desktop publishing unit led by Mr. Muhammad Abubakar for creative inputs.
INTRODUCTION

The UNESCO Institute of Statistics (UIS) report (2006) defines teachers as "professional personnel involved in direct student instruction". This involves planning, organizing and conducting group activities, whereby students' knowledge, skills and attitudes develop as stipulated by educational programmes. World Teachers' Day, celebrated annually on 5th October to commemorate the 1966 Recommendations adopted jointly by ILO/UNESCO on the Status of Teachers, aptly focuses on the overarching theme of "Quality Teachers for Quality Education". The theme underscores the truism that access without quality is unsustainable, and cannot lead to entitlements for poverty reduction in the spirit of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Education For All (EFA) goals.

The 21st century is driven by knowledge-based economies, which make new demands on the teaching-learning interaction, impacting upon a range of issues including classical traditional modes of dialogue and content mastery to integration of multiple intelligences, information communication technologies (ICTs) in pedagogy and continuous professional development. These new demands and emerging challenges, juxtaposed against the learning needs of students, call for an ever expanding role of teachers, to enable them to perform multiple roles as educators and achieve a range of ancillary goals aimed at value addition and externalities, which can lead to poverty reduction and empowerment.

Preparing teachers for the challenges of a rapidly changing world means equipping them with methods and opportunities for upgrading subject-specific expertise; implementing effective teaching practices; instilling an understanding of technology and emerging sciences, such as life skills; and, the ability to work collaboratively with other teachers, communities and parents. This is needed at a time when the teaching profession in Pakistan is suffering from low morale and motivation; poor standards of performance; low remuneration packages; slow career mobility; a growing trend towards contract rather than permanent employment; disparate and poor standards of pre- and in-service training; and generally low levels of institutional support.

The expression `status' as used in relation to teachers means both the standing or regard accorded to them, as evidenced by the level of appreciation of the importance of their function, their competence in performing it, the working conditions, remuneration and other material benefits relative to other professional groups. According to the 1966 Recommendations, the status of teachers has three specific attributes:

1. Professional competence, to discharge their ever expanding role with skill and authority
2. Economic standing, which reflects the net worth of individuals according to their responsibilities and job descriptions
3. Social standing of the profession, as an outcome of the above two and a little more.

The objective of this booklet is to provide information about the status of teachers in Pakistan, their roles and their working conditions, and to identify the potential for them to influence policies/programmes. Teachers are considered to be the lynchpin of the education system. The booklet covers teachers from schools up to the higher secondary level (K-Grade XII) in: (i) formal sector government schools; (ii) formal sector private schools; (iii) Non-Formal Basic Education (NFBE) Centres; and (iv) Deeni Madaris.

2 1966 Recommendations: Part I Definitions
The booklet attempts to capture the distinctive variations from each province and locations within provinces, to highlight issues around provision, diversity and complexity. Educational provision and its implications for the status of teachers in the public and private sectors are highlighted. Policy level issues are framed in the booklet so that they may be addressed by decision makers, in a climate that depends on iterative policymaking and planning, with a particular focus on teachers.

There are seven sections in this booklet:

- Section I contains the introduction, which outlines the key challenges for World Teachers’ Day 2007.
- Section II focuses on the country context, locating the scale, provision across state and non-state providers against the backdrop of teachers in Pakistan.
- Section III addresses the issue of professional competencies.
- Section IV highlights issues around the social status of, and perceptions about, teachers in society.
- Section V examines the economic status of teachers.
- Section VI addresses the National Policy Context, and discusses issues and their implications for the status of teachers, including outputs of recent policy debates and round-table discussions.
- Section VII presents policy issues and recommendations for the future.
SITUATION ANALYSIS: Teachers in The Pakistan Context

A country with a population of 165 million spread across four provinces, containing 110 districts, and four area governments (ICT, FATA, FANA & AJK), Pakistan is still struggling with a net enrolment rate of 52% at the primary level and a literacy rate of 56%.

According to the National Education Census (NEC) data (2005-2006), there are 227,791 institutions profiled at all levels of the education system and across all providers, with a teaching force of 1.36 million.

Whereas the teaching force is evenly distributed across educational levels (see Table 1), the education pyramid in the country has a very broad base at the primary level, thinning out at the middle and secondary levels, and with a fine peak at the tertiary level.

### Table 1: Education Profile of Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>173,553</td>
<td>37,428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>38,449</td>
<td>418,376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>25,090</td>
<td>313,797</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>425,927</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GENDER DISTRIBUTION OF TEACHERS

In overall aggregate terms, the numbers of male and female teaching personnel appear to be almost equal, with women having a slight edge in the overall national figures, at 51%. However, when disaggregated at the provincial level, equal gender representation drops from 51% to 38% for female teachers in FANA, 32% in NWFP and Balochistan and 25% in FATA. Despite having an overall equal presence, the effectiveness of female teachers continue to be undermined on account of pervasive patriarchal traditions, the public private divide, and negative customary practices. The provincial Departments of Education and the Ministry of Education have formally adopted policies of hiring more female teachers at the primary level, being appropriate and sensitive to the nurturing needs of younger children. The Government of Punjab has taken bold steps to recruit female teachers in male elementary schools, a positive shift towards creating “a culture of care”.

---

3 Economic Survey 2006-07
4 The National Education Census (NEC) undertaken in 2005
SITUATION ANALYSIS: Teachers In The Pakistan Context

**Teachers’ Profile Across Provinces:** Diverse Provision

The provincial distribution of teachers in Pakistan varies significantly, matching demographic distribution as well as the core development indicators of both provinces and districts. According to the NEC 2006⁶, within the public sector, Punjab accounts for 47.3% or 315,078 teachers, whereas FANA has the lowest share of teachers at 0.86% or 5,777 teachers.

**Table 2: Number of Teachers by Province⁶**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province/Region</th>
<th>Total Number of Teachers</th>
<th>Share of Total in Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>315,078</td>
<td>47.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>143,699</td>
<td>21.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>108,905</td>
<td>16.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>39,963</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJK</td>
<td>25,745</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>19,655</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>6,724</td>
<td>1.102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FANA</td>
<td>577</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>665,549</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Public vs. Private Provision:**
Emerging Opportunities & Challenges

Private educational provision has grown rapidly since 2000 at a rate of 25% annually (according to data from NEC). By 2005, there were 81,103 private institutions in the country⁷. While the public private institutional provision is 67% and 33% respectively, the spread of the teaching force is almost equally distributed between the two sectors, with 53% the of teachers being located in the public sector and 47% in the private sector. Hiring teachers in the private sector is easier than in the public sector, and constitutes a non-negotiable element for client satisfaction. Parents pay user charges and in consequence, expect teachers to be present in person, at the very minimum. In the public sector, repeated bans on recruitment have persisted over many years, the reasons for which are embedded in the political economy of education in the country.

In Pakistan, despite evidence to the contrary, a predominantly public sector-centric view of the education system persists. In light of the very evident contribution of the private sector in this regard, there is a long-overdue need to acknowledge that the balance of education provision is increasingly moving towards non-state providers, particularly in the post-primary sub-sectors. This is mainly on account of the public sector’s inability to manage both quality and quantity objectives, the low capacity to utilize resources, as well as undue politicisation of educational provision.

---

⁵ NEC, 2006
⁶ Education Census, 2006-2007
⁷ FBS, 1999-2000; NEC 2005-06
Deeni Madaris: Non-State, Faith-Based Education Providers

NEC data shows Deeni Madaris as a substantial category of non-state educational providers, accounting for 12,153 institutions, with an enrolment of 1.5 million and a teaching force of approximately 55,000. However, little is known about teacher preparation, promotion, quality, re-numeration, professional hierarchies and other attributes for this sub-sector of educational providers.

The policy of mainstreaming madaris still remains a challenge, requiring the creation of common national standards for learning, teachers' status and quality, both across madaris and other types of educational providers.

Table 4: Profiling Madaris

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Wafaq / Tanzeem/ Rabita</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Enrolment</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rabita-tul-Madaris Islamia</td>
<td>903</td>
<td>127,800</td>
<td>4,885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wafaq-ul-Madaris</td>
<td>3,431</td>
<td>545,825</td>
<td>21,106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzeem-ul-Madaris</td>
<td>2,633</td>
<td>338,097</td>
<td>12,157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>927</td>
<td>101,241</td>
<td>3,742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Affiliated</td>
<td>3,507</td>
<td>344,473</td>
<td>11,080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>12,153</td>
<td>1,512,445</td>
<td>54,909</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Rural-Urban Teacher Divide

The rural-urban divide with regards to the aggregate teaching force in Pakistan is 51% and 49% respectively\(^2\) and this division can also be observed across all the provinces and the federally administered areas through the table.

The challenges of the adequacy of rural teachers across various levels of schooling, the availability of subject-specialist teachers, their pay and incentives packages, and management and support systems remain major areas of concern, particularly in the public sector.

Table 5: Teaching Staff in Rural & Urban Areas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Rural</th>
<th>Urban</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>1,356,802</td>
<td>687,613 (51%)</td>
<td>669,189 (49%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>716,768</td>
<td>365,061 (51%)</td>
<td>351,707 (49%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>290,749</td>
<td>84,495 (29%)</td>
<td>206,254 (71%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>198,893</td>
<td>139,104 (70%)</td>
<td>59,789 (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>50,893</td>
<td>29,716 (58%)</td>
<td>21,177 (42%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>19,387</td>
<td>4,656 (24%)</td>
<td>14,731 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>22,079</td>
<td>22,079 (100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FANA</td>
<td>15,196</td>
<td>12,222 (80%)</td>
<td>2,974 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJK</td>
<td>42,837</td>
<td>30,280 (71%)</td>
<td>12,557 (29%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{1}\) NEC 2006
\(^{2}\) NEC 2006
Quality & Shifting Paradigms: From In-Service Training to Continuous Professional Development

Various surveys and studies undertaken in Pakistan reinforce a bleak picture of teacher education and its impact on student learning outcomes\(^\text{10}\). Their findings, by and large, are as follows:

(i) public sector teachers perform poorly in subject competencies;

(ii) their academic qualifications have had a somewhat positive influence on student performance, more so than their professional (training) qualifications\(^\text{11}\); and

(iii) students from public sector schools perform worse than their private sector counterparts at the primary and middle level. These findings reinforce the need for major strategies to help teachers continuously improve their knowledge, skills and attitudes\(^\text{12}\). Absence of quality has to be tackled urgently in a context where teacher-learner interactions are mediated by a supportive management, as well as an enabling policy environment.

---

Box 1: The Shifting Paradigm of Teacher Education: Adjusting Systemically to New Realities

- From transmission to constructivism: teachers as active learners
- From one-off training to long term systematic training opportunities, at the local, provincial and national levels
- From fragmented dislocated training, to processes in contexts and cultures that make space for on-service capacity-building opportunities addressing lifelong teacher education
- From skill training, to training on content supported by school/curricular reforms
- From isolated/individual efforts, to collaborative processes where support groups can be developed through mentors or District Teacher Educators and Teacher Educators
- From empty vessels to adult reflective practitioners, seeking support from new approaches in cognitive sciences, mental models and leaders of change (still to be fully incorporated)
- From passive participants, to thinkers, actors and key reform agents.

---


\(^\text{11}\) UNESCO 2002

\(^\text{12}\) Iqbal 2007
PROFESSIONAL COMPETENCIES & DEVELOPMENT

The public sector is a large provider of professional development services for teachers and administrators alike in the country. The Directorate of Staff Development (DSD), the apex in-service teacher training body of the Government of Punjab, has engaged in a paradigm shift from traditional cascade models to continuous professional development (CPD). This innovation has influenced other provincial and area governments, as well.

Figure 2: Shifting Paradigm of Teacher Education

- School based
- Field Based-Cluster Based

Pre-Service  On-Service  In-Service

From Teacher Education to Professional Educational Development ...Lifelong Learning

Such an approach engages and simultaneously underlines the fact that it is not only content skills which are critical, but also that there is tremendous value addition in the processes of reflection, collaborative work, mentoring, problem solving and in recognition of the local contexts in which change and professional development take place. This approach merits the conceptualization of a type of teacher education which seeks mergers between pre-, on-service (school-and field-based) and in-service training opportunities, as part of a continuum of lifelong professional learning.

In the public sector, there are reportedly over 600 institutions, including resource centres and DTSC, often working with minimal human and insufficient and/or unpredictable financial resources, to effectively support professional development needs. The primary mandate of public sector facilities, barring universities, is to meet the training needs of their own teachers. Trend analysis reveals that the non-state sector, particularly the private and not-for-profit school networks or chains, is increasingly addressing teachers' professional development needs in more creative ways, through elaborate in-house programmes with substantive investments, yielding high rates of return and positive outcomes.

Several donor agencies are also engaged in this critical area supporting capacity for addressing quality concerns such as CIDA, USAID, the World Bank, ADB, DFID, GTZ, UNICEF, UNESCO, European Commission and several INGOs. CIDA is supporting teacher education and up-grading in the public sector through a large debt swap programme (C$ 447 million) to assist Pakistan honour the commitment made in Dakar 2000.

Recently, debate has been initiated on the issue of a national accreditation system for upgrading the status of teachers and for their professionalization. This will not only define objective standards for teachers' competencies, but will also provide equivalence, enabling them to move across provinces on the basis of legitimate professional merit. The HEC has established a National Accreditation Council for teaching/teacher training institutions in November 2007, with initial activities around the creation of inventories for teacher education programmes. There is, however, concern regarding the low level of public debate and involvement in discussion on the scope of a National Accreditation Council, even though this was amply expressed in the social dialogues of WTD 2006.

13 Jamil, B 2004
16 ITA’s Social Dialogues held in 2006 for WTD 2006, in collaboration with UNESCO.
Teacher Shortage: Design or Default?

There is a chronic shortage of teachers in Pakistan, and some of it appears to be by design rather than by default. This provocative statement is substantiated by the fact that this critical bottleneck is inherently built into the policy and planning templates of education provision - first and foremost at the primary level in the public sector.

Since primary provision is highest in the public sector (121,856 primary schools are in the public sector out of a total of 142,384 primary schools), the formula for opening schools has traditionally been that of two teachers and two rooms, for all government schemes for new expenditures (SNEs) and development programmes.

This has resulted in the creation of huge backlogs of teacher shortages - two teachers managing six classes/grades; and dysfunctional multi-grade teaching-learning scenarios - which can safely be called ‘officially’ planned, under “provisioned” primary schools. The chronic shortage of teachers is also an outcome of the prevailing service rules and institutionalized leave policies in the public sector, which render teachers eligible for multiple types of paid ‘official leaves’.

The status of teachers is thus compromised through such flawed provisions, making them under-perform and earn low respect, particularly towards those teachers working in the public sector.

Box 2: Shortage of Teachers Underestimated in the EFA Plan

The EFA NPA 2001-2015 projects a conservative, under-estimated shortage of primary teachers, 56,100 teachers in 2006 (the first five years of the Plan). This estimate is based on the assumption of 2 teachers per primary school; one pesh imam per mosque school (which, however are declining in numbers, as they have been rejected by the provinces due to their minimalist provision).
The Social Status of Teachers

Perceptions of Teachers in Society

There is a recurrent comment in education circles, that “the teaching profession has hit rock bottom”. The profession is associated with paradoxical perceptions of being on the one hand, the oldest and noblest of professions as practiced by the Prophets, the ancient philosophers and Sufis alike, but is also simultaneously seen, on the other hand, as the “last career choice for merit-worthy, capable people”.

Both societal perceptions and the actual status of teachers in Pakistan vary across geographical regions, urban rural locations, and in state/non-state educational perspectives. A commonly-held perception is that teaching positions are not sought after, and lie at the bottom of the ladder, in terms of career options. A number of factors combine to produce this view: (i) the state of government schools (42% of which suffer from missing facilities); (ii) lack of standards and credibility of educational provision and low levels of training skills; (iii) absence of monitoring and support; and (iv) uneven practices of recruitment and promotion. All of these contribute in putting the teaching profession low on the priority list of career options.

A survey by KZR in the late 1990s found that although 87 percent of students regarded teaching as “the most respectable profession”, only 42 percent marked it as their first choice of career. Even parents did not regard teaching as a preferred choice for their children. However, in a separate study, 54% of the women surveyed regarded it as a desirable profession. Teaching is seen as the most feasible career option for women, both in rural and urban areas, due to prevailing socio-cultural norms regarding gender; and the general perception that teaching in the public sector has many benefits relating to employment conditions. The number of holidays and the “half day” time commitment, combined with a steady income stream are seen to be particularly beneficial for women, as it allows them to manage both domestic and productive responsibilities more easily, whilst also steadily contributing to the household income. In the service based rural economy, men tend to opt for teaching, as it provides an easily available job opportunity in a context of rising unemployment for the educated. The half-day time commitment of a teaching job helps both male and female teachers to engage in other remunerative activities on the side, including private tutoring and working in private academies in the afternoon/evenings to supplement income.

Compared to perceptions on teaching in primary and secondary schools, the perceptions of the status of teachers are changing positively in the higher education sector in Pakistan, where sector reforms have led to the installation of a tenure track system of merit-based and performance-based recruitment, promotion and salary scales. This has made the profession at this end of the sector comparatively competitive, and equal to other market-driven options.

---

20 Sayed & Akbar, 2007
21 NEC, 2005
22 KZR, 1997
23 Save the Children Study, 2001
24 Sayed & Akbar, 2007; Khan, 2005
25 <http://www.hec.gov.pk>
THE ECONOMIC STATUS OF TEACHERS
THE ECONOMIC STATUS OF TEACHERS

Economic status is seen as a critical measure to assess the status of teachers, especially in what is perceived as an overworked and underpaid profession. There is a general consensus based on recent data and studies\(^{28}\) that pay scales for public sector teachers have increased over the years. In comparison with other professions, such as medicine, engineering, IT, however, the salary scales of teachers are considerably lower, with fewer perks and benefits. Many teachers have made bitter, yet factual comparisons as to why they do not receive the same status as is given to other public servants. One factor is that education has still not been declared as an essential service, which would have financial implications as well as an impact on the working hours of teachers and their leave schedules.

In the public sector, the salaries are governed by the Basic Pay Scales (BPS) system, originally devised for administrative and managerial staff, rather than for the teaching profession. The BPS is qualification-driven, that is, any improvement in BPS or a promotion is largely determined by improvement in qualifications. There is no separate pay structure for teachers. The BPS for teachers ranges from Grade 7 (primary) to Grade 20 (higher secondary). Annual increments within the BPS may be quite nominal, unless the government uses this route for incentivization of the profession. Some of the recent initiatives in this respect are shared here. Compared to the public sector, in the private/NGO sector, the variations in teacher pay scales are tremendous, as noted by various studies\(^ {27}\). The range in the private sector can be from as low as Rs. 600 per month (non-formal community/non-elite private schools) to Rs. 50,000 and more, in elite private schools, rising to six digits at the post secondary level.

Figure 3: Incentivization of the Teaching profession: Increments 1992-2004\(^{28}\)

Trend analysis reveals that over the years from 1992-2004, public sector pay packages have been enhanced. A 2007 study which draws on data from the Labour Force Surveys\(^ {27}\), revealed the following trends. Salary levels have risen between 1999-2000 to 2005-06, and inequality across primary school teachers has narrowed in 2005-06 (in comparison with 1999-2000). The differentials in earnings among the provinces have decreased over this seven year period. However, the share of teaching professionals (at all levels) has declined from 50% to 25%, because of the criterion of higher qualifications and/or the demand for other non-teaching professions.

There are adverse differentials for private sector teachers compared to their public sector counterparts at the primary level. Disparities also exist within private sector providers.

\(^{26}\) See among others, Khan, 2005; Akhtar/AKU IED 2007;
\(^{27}\) Sayyed and Akbar 2007, GoPunjab 2007
\(^{28}\) Khan 2005, Sayyed & Akbar 2007
\(^{29}\) Khan, 2005
\(^{27}\) Sajjad Akhtar, 2007; and ibid, p. 70
THE ECONOMIC STATUS OF TEACHERS

Contract Teachers as Educators & Para-Teachers

For public sector education, the Government of Punjab, in collaboration with its major lender, the World Bank, decided to embark on an incremental approach to compensate for the chronic teacher shortage. This approach was seen as:

(i) circumventing the (federal) ban on recruitment through contract hiring;
(ii) raising minimum entry qualification for primary/elementary from matric/PTC or FA/CT, to BA/BSc/B.Ed.;
(iii) minimizing its financial outlays for salary recurrent expenditures, through the institution of flat rates of compensation without recourse to legal challenges; and
(iv) minimizing and/or controlling issues of non-performing teachers, since contract renewal would be performance based.

Contract teachers were hired as “educators”, with possible pay scales ranging from Rs. 4500 to Rs. 6500 per month, up to secondary level. However, because they are hired as contract teachers, they are free to leave their jobs as and when they want, without notice, thus, yet again leaving behind a system that fails to deliver quality education. Teachers hired on contract have been continue to protest about their compromised status, even after three years of service. They have expressed a lack of confidence in the system on several occasions for undermining their status by characterising their jobs as “sub-contracted” low paid, low status workers.

Teacher shortages in subject specialist positions at middle and secondary levels, for mathematics, science, and English means that supply constraints enable teachers to demand better, market-driven salary packages, particularly in the private sector. Recently the public sector’s upward salary revisions in Punjab and Sindh have made teachers comparatively better off, particularly at the middle, secondary and post-secondary levels.

Gender Dimensions: Wages by Sector

Whilst there is no difference in wages between men and women in the public sector, in the private sector the differential is noticeable. Women teachers in the private sector tend to get lower wages than their male counterparts. This is an area of concern, which needs to be addressed in the context of the concept of “Decent Work”, by teacher unions, labour law regulators and also owners/managers of private sector provision.

30 Recently the government announced an incentive package for teachers which included contract teachers. In the announcement by the Government of Punjab, as a Special Package for teachers on Sept 24, 2007, the Notification (No. SO (S III) 2-16/2007) specifies nine incentives for teachers. These almost coincided with the World Teachers Day 2007 and are significant, as they imply major costs for the province. The cost of these measures, however, needs to be considered seriously, as it may pave the way for making national standards, in the future, for the rest of the country in the future as part of a structural reform programme for teachers’ pay packages, career paths and their economic status.
THE NATIONAL POLICY CONTEXT:
ISSUES & IMPLICATIONS FOR TEACHERS STATUS;
RECENT POLICY DEBATES & ROUNDTABLES

Section 6
Pakistan has witnessed a robust period for policy reforms since 1998. These have taken place at multiple levels since the nationwide Devolution Plan of 2001. Broadly speaking, the term “policy”, as used here, is taken to mean both policy and reform initiatives at the national, provincial and district levels. Under the overarching internationally agreed goals (EFA & MDGs) which link educational development with poverty reduction, Pakistan has put in place the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) and the Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF) as strategic planning and budgetary frameworks. In addition to these national policies, provincial sector reform initiatives, such as the Punjab Education Sector Reforms Programme (PESRP), the Sindh Education Plan and the Five Year Education Sector Plans (Sindh & NWFP 2002-2007) have also contributed to the possible options and policy positions on teachers’ and educational quality, highlighting, in turn, the federal and provincial stances, and offering space for policy and reform negotiation.

Analysis of past policies and sector reform documents reveals that teachers have occupied a critical space in the pursuit of the educational quality agenda, as well as that of nation-building. The 1959 Education Commission concluded that “no system of education is better than its teachers”. The NEP 1998-2010 states that “the teacher is considered the most crucial factor in implementing all educational reforms at the grass-roots level”. More recently, the White Paper 2007 calls for “efforts, through a variety of incentives, to be undertaken to re-establish the social status of teachers in society, to beckon higher intellectual and enthused capacity into the teaching profession”.

51 The MTDF is a five year planning framework (2005-2010), adopted by the Government of Pakistan, and is coordinated through the Planning Commission. All baseline benchmark statistics and targets are drawn from 2004-2005 data.
52 UNESCO/USAID, 2006
53 Commission on National Education, 1959. p. 265
54 Commission on National Education, 1959. p. 26
POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

The policy issues and recommendations presented below are a summary of the conclusions of several major documents, including the emerging (draft) National Education Policy; roundtables and policy dialogues; and the recommendations of important reports, studies and World Teachers' Day meetings/symposia from 2005 onwards.

Policy-Related Issues

Analysis of teachers and their professional development has been carried out since the 1990s, as a part of each wave of sector reforms. Since 2000, there has been a spate of studies as part of the work done by national and provincial Education Task Forces, expert group meetings and round table discussions on sector reforms, as well as the National Education Policy review processes.\(^6\) These deliberations and research studies have provided rich, evidence-based insights into the issues that frame policy and action initiatives.

The major issues that plague teachers in Pakistan are presented below, in relation to both the public and private sectors.

1.1 Policy & Frameworks

- There is a lack of a single, strategic national policy and framework relating to teachers that could ensure consistent standards of teacher recruitment, career mobility, teacher education and accreditation and certification regimes. At present, disparate systems prevail across the country.

- The private sector is a fast growing education provider, which is outstripping the public sector in post-primary education. It is an employer of 47% teachers, yet it is not fully integrated in the national drive and planning for EFA and poverty reduction through provision of access to quality education.

1.2 Recruitment & Career Paths

- Not only is teacher recruitment in the public sector not based on merit, but it is also frequently politically influenced. Nepotism and political interference are also commonly seen in teacher management. Widespread irregular postings and transfers undermine the authority and writ of managers.

- There is a lack of separation of cadres, between teachers, managers, and trainers. This leads to role confusion, low levels of specialisation, and systemic instability.

- There is inconsistency in the institutional practices of hiring teachers between the provinces. Punjab and NWFP hire school-specific, area-based contract graduate teachers (with 15 years of education including a one year professional degree) with a flat basic pay level equivalent to BS 09-16. Other provinces hire only matric PTC teachers (with 11 years of education). The private sector, on the other hand, is market-driven and seen by some as exploitative, offering different levels and packages of hiring ranging from Rs. 500 to six digit figures.

---

POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

• The Primary Teaching Certificate (PTC) and Certificate of Teaching (CT) are inadequate qualifications for a teacher at the primary/elementary level. The question remains as to whether their standard can be raised across the country, to achieve an improvement in educational quality.

• There is a high rate of teacher turnover in both public contract teachers and the private sector, due to poor salary levels and conditions of employment. At present, there are few incentives for teachers to upgrade professionally.

• The use of “para teachers”, non-formal teachers, part-time and visiting faculty is a pragmatic mechanism to address teacher shortages. However, it also has the undesired effect of making teachers into a sub-contracted and under-valued subsection of the labour force, compromising their professional, social and economic status.

1.3 Facilitating Teachers’ Voice in Policymaking & Planning
• The engagement of teachers in policymaking and planning is ad hoc, event driven and dictated by the whims of senior managers and planners, which undermines the very purpose of engaging with teachers’ voices.

• There are few systematic and formal opportunities for fulfilling this function with regularity and predictability, and this applies to all categories of teachers (public, private, formal and non-formal), at all educational levels. There is no forum for teachers dedicated to influencing policy and planning.

• Teachers Unions are uneven in focus and some have lost links with their mandate (as powerfully outlined in the 1966/97 recommendations on the status of teachers).

1.4 Research & Evidence-Based Policy & Practice
• There tends to be little focus on the use of research to inform policymaking and practice. Where there is research, it is mostly quantitative (rather than qualitative) and is not used effectively for evidence-based policymaking: (eg. the NEC data, or the material on the rise of the private sector and its implications for teachers and teachers’ education).

• Resources for research on teachers are limited and often only donor supported, with little regular support from mainstream funds. Research has rarely built in feedback loops to inform practice.

• Collaborative research practice across teacher education institutes and amongst practicing teachers is non-existent (barring some active individual practitioners). Thus, teachers continue to be seen as a homogeneous mass of uncaring personnel, without conscience and motivation. This negative view may not reflect the reality of teachers, but there is scanty research available on their lives and work.

2. Quality & Governance: Lack of Institutional Arrangements
• Devolution has led to a lack of clarity on the responsibilities and the division of labour in public sector teacher education and support across the district, provincial and federal governments.

• Since 2001, major public sector initiatives in teacher education and reform have been centralized at the provincial level. As a result, the space for innovations and their sustainability at the district level is very limited, in relation to quality interventions by district governments. The institutional and reform arrangements across provinces and districts are not easy to navigate.
POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

- There is little two-way coordination of professional teacher training activities across federally-administered areas and the provinces; and across provinces and districts.
- There is a virtual absence of dialogue between and across public and private sector providers.
- Teachers' professional development and teacher training is fragmented, with many disparate institutional variations, in both apex institutions and their branches across the country. No formal institutional arrangements exist for teacher education standards, accreditation and certification.
- There is a major management/supervision deficit in the public sector, as compared to the private sector.
- There is lack of community involvement in teacher deployment and performance assessment.

3. Professional Development: Teacher Education & Training

- Pre-service and in-service training are often de-linked. In-service training is fragmented, donor driven, poorly coordinated, and not always needs- or context-based.
- The pre-service training curriculum is outdated and has not been comprehensively revised for many decades, only having experienced piecemeal efforts at change.
- Most teacher trainers in public sector are non-specialists, who are simply senior teachers with little capacity to manage elementary education requirements.
- Teacher training is heavily focused on the primary level, at the expense of other sub-sectors.

- Content and pedagogical skills need to be handled concurrently in teacher education.
- Monitoring and follow-up of change efforts for implementing innovative practices is required, to ensure that teachers do not lapse back into earlier routines and practices. Some donor-led initiatives are stepping in to address the gap, but the question of their sustainability remains.
- The scaling up of teacher education programmes initiated through donor support faces a number of challenges, particularly low systemic and budgetary ownership.
- Measuring quality as learning outcomes is not consistently undertaken cross-nationally, and lacks a clear demarcation of roles and responsibilities of the various organizations involved.

4. Culture & Professional Ethics

- Teachers do not always value their own importance as transmitters of 'culture' and contributors to school culture. This undermines the ethos of the learning environment.
- Teachers are generally perceived as arrogant, with harsh attitudes towards their "clients" - both parents and children. Teachers continuously complain at formal and informal forums, that "since the government ban on corporal punishment, our standards of education have declined!" They tend to pass on the authoritarian attitudes of their own managers to students and parents. Some teachers have rationalized harsh treatment towards children as an outdated but socially approved mandate of "haddan hamarein maas tumhara" ("our bones, your skins"). This is part of a perverse cultural practice that needs to be purged urgently.
POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

- Teachers lack awareness towards their core responsibility of creating and contributing to professional ethics and codes of conduct. This skill is not integral to organized training, what is a sensibility that may just “come along the way” or, may not.

- The teacher unions have not been able to do justice to the task of elevating the culture and code of professional ethics for teaching cadres.

B Recommendations & Required Policy Responses

Primary Principles

The challenges of quality learning are multiplying in an increasingly complex and volatile society. Teachers are expected to rise to the status of becoming extraordinary professionals to cope with multiple, shifting and expanding demands of today and tomorrow. Education systems cannot function today without outcomes, and teachers’ status (competence, economic and social) will have to be enhanced through a wider inclusive approach by the state and its partners. A fast-changing education landscape of public and private providers in education service delivery and training must be acknowledged, with several possibilities available for sharing the burden and responsibilities for the uplift of teachers’ professional status.

The recommendations presented below should be duly considered for incorporation into the draft New Education Policy (NEP), which is to be finalised in 2008 by the new government and parliament.

1. A special group of experts and teachers from all delivery systems, including HEC/Teacher Accreditation Council representatives, needs to be mobilized to work out the scope, principles and operational details of the NEP. Sub-committees must be formed for specific clusters of recommendations for focused actions pertaining to: policy, legal and institutional, and resource implications.

2. A National Teacher Policy and Strategic Framework for Teachers’ Recruitment/Induction, Teachers’ Education, and Teachers’ performance is long overdue. This needs to be developed for all teachers in the country, as a sub-set of the National Education Policy (to be finalized shortly). This must take into account data driven re-profiling highlighting various dimensions that impinge on teachers’ quality. However, it needs to be designed without the previous baggage of ‘public sector only’ lens and forced adjustment of defunct institutions that may not or do not work, e.g. Technical Panel of Teacher Education (TPTE) & in some cases even PITEs.

3. Recognition of the New Architecture of the Education Delivery System is urgently required accommodating non-state partners, taking into account all options for addressing teachers’ status comprehensively and irreversibly.

4. A well articulated system of national standards and accreditation needs to be in place for different levels and categories of teacher education, uniformly spread across the public and private sectors. This must include recruitment criteria, acquisition of competencies and eligibility for teaching and management positions, and salary scales. The process needs at least a five to ten year phased planning, budgeting and implementation period, managed through consensus and impeccable expertise. This long-overdue exercise will result in standard-setting and a resultant re-profiling of teachers’ professional status. It is a critical national necessity and must be accompanied by a “buy in” for provincial and national certification of teachers as professional institutions. Such a
POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

process should include:
• establishing pre-requisites (basic qualifications/competence benchmarks) to attract the best people in the profession;
• specified competency levels by level and subjects, and
• options for modular professional development: on-job and pre-service up-gradation, and career mobility and growth through pre-service and continuous professional development.\(^{37}\)

The provisions of the Local Government Ordinance 2001 under the Devolution Plan need to be reviewed to ensure concurrent support to teachers' education, quality and management across district, provincial and national levels.

Figure 6: National Teachers’ Policy Framework \(^{38}\)

5. Teachers' Recruitment, Qualification, Salaries, Transfers and Postings and Career Progression: Minimum National Standards of recruitment need to be defined and aptitude tests should be installed to ensure meritocratic hiring similar to other professions.

• Separate cadres need to be created with clear roles and career paths of teachers as managers, trainers and teachers. Organized as a specialized function, it must include teachers' professional development as part of its mandate. However, its effective functioning would require clarity of roles and responsibilities on the part of the district and provincial governments. Detailed exercises already conducted in NWFP should be formally considered as a model to take this initiative forward.

• A minimum educational qualification of BA/BSc/B.Ed for teachers up to elementary education, and MA/M.Sc with at least one professional qualification for secondary and higher secondary education, with commensurate salary packages, should be ensured by 2020. PTC and CT must be phased out with options to upgrade qualifications. Relaxations for remote areas must be considered on a case-by-case basis in locations where qualified teachers may be in short supply.

• Decent wage scales at different levels of education need to be defined. These must be in line with the National Labour Laws for Decent Employment.

• A closer link needs to be developed with higher education as the main supplier of trained human resources.

\(^{38}\) Jamil, Baela R. Adapted from her 2004 paper (2007)
POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

- Substitute teachers should be made available to fill in for teachers who have to go on long leaves or attend training.
- The process of recruitment, transfer and postings of teachers should be de-politicized and replaced with merit-based hiring, with preference being given to local teachers.
- Incentives should be introduced for teachers' recruitment and service, in hard-to-reach areas. These should be institutionalized and accountability systems should be strengthened to improve performance.
- The Contract Teachers Policy adopted by NWFP and Punjab to overcome shortage, quality and phasing out of permanent cadres needs to be re-examined as a formal policy option with guidelines, criteria, salary packages, disbursals, appraisals and benefits. Contract teachers must be given an option for a permanent position after 3 years of performance against predetermined standards for continuity and professional dignity.

6. Teacher Education, Training, Professional Development & Accreditation: Teacher education needs to overhaul its pre- and in-service provisions.

- Public-private partnerships need to be encouraged, to upgrade the capacity of teachers in all sectors, with sound institutional mechanisms, which are not cumbersome and which are predictable.
- The HEC, as a resource-rich Commission, must be formally approached for supporting a national teachers' training program formalized through a PC1.
- Meaningful linkages between pre- and in-service training need to be made to recognize and institutionalise the shift towards continuous professional development. In-service training should have an efficient structure, with proper provision in recurrent budgets. Study leaves must be granted to government primary teachers as well as provisions for leaves to upgrade their qualifications.
- Concepts of citizenship, rights, environmental awareness, health, HIV, and inclusive and population education, with gender as a cross-cutting issue, must be integrated into the relevant training. Peer group discussion, class observation, distance learning, self-study, and ICT-based professional development options must be factored into the CPD programmes.
- The curriculum for teacher education should address the needs of the changing school curriculum and new requirements based on brain-based research, emerging disciplines and life skills incorporated into it. The revision of the school curriculum must also invoke a review of the teacher education curriculum.
- Linkages between apex institutions, feeder or link institutions of professional education including institutional setups at district levels and non-state providers need to be formally established. Distance learning programmes and the Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU) under its restructured programmes must be fully integrated into the national strategy for professional development of teachers.
- Apex teacher education institutions need to be designated across the country with common core standards, characteristics and suitable personnel. There need to be national and provincial Councils for Teachers’ Licensing and Accreditation, to register professional teachers and to monitor preparation and their life-long professional development.
- Apex teacher education institutions need to be designated across the country with common core standards
POLICY ISSUES & RECOMMENDATIONS

characteristics and suitable personnel. There need to be national and provincial Councils for Teachers’ Licensing and Accreditation, to register professional teachers and to monitor preparation and their life-long professional development.

- The standards set by accreditation body should be designed keeping in mind the “average mean” of teachers’ skills, ensuring that a maximum number of teachers can be enabled to succeed in certifications.

- Trainings should be carried out through cluster-based resource centres/TRCs; site based, innovative mobile training, and district level training opportunities for both public and non-state providers should be explored. Extended training of more than a week should be organized in the vacations and shorter trainings should be conducted after school timings.

7. Teachers’ Performance and Quality Assurance: A Quality Assurance body must be installed with appropriate monitoring tools for schools of all types. Just as there is the HEC, a School Education Commission (SEC) must be established as an autonomous body, with major capital and recurrent funding from the government, to ensure Quality Education For All (QEFA). Quality assurance systems should not ignore head teachers. Evaluation of head teachers and subsequent training for quality needs to be organized.

- An evaluation of teacher service delivery needs to be carried out if quality of education is to be improved. Quality audits should have a wider focus, to evaluate how teachers relate subjects to pupils’ daily lives.

- Attendance and leave rules for teaching personnel must be urgently revised in the public sector: teachers cannot be treated in the same spirit as other civil servants but with shorter hours of duty. To track practices of absenteeism and good performance, an efficient human resource MIS must be put in place. Besides training and upgrading female teachers, there should be measures to improve their work and living conditions and provide them with safer, improved and more pastorally-caring career opportunities.

This would help retain them in the profession.

- Teacher grooming academies should be established at district and provincial levels to reflect and improve knowledge, practice and attitudes.

- Teacher and head teacher unions, including professional associations, must play a pro-active role in re-positioning the status of teachers; providing mentorship programs for content and attitudinal improvements; as well as the opportunity for teaching practice. The present political collaboration by the unions, holding education at ransom, must end.

8. Teachers must be encouraged to publish individual and collective stories of good and caring practices of change and innovations which re-positions them as extraordinarily skilled crafters of society and its citizens.

- The Pakistan National Book Foundation (NBF) and private publishers should advertise competitions for these stories, soliciting contributions in local, provincial, national and international languages for wider public dissemination. These should be regularly documented and publicly acknowledged through national awards, increments and appreciation certificates during EFA Week, Independence Day and World Teachers’ Day. If soldiers and armed personnel can be given exemplary awards for courage, teachers cannot continue to be left out, as perhaps they form the most eligible category for national awards.

- The outcomes of the above must be embedded in evidence-based work, research and modes of collaborative research, with and for teachers to help them “reinvent and extend their work, their personal and public spaces.”

---

39 As per the MTDF 2007; p 20:17
40 NEP draft, 2007
42 Torres & Hunt 2006


CIDA. Briefing Note. The Pakistan Canada Debt for Education Conversion: Background and Current Status.


BIBLIOGRAPHY


BIBLIOGRAPHY


BIBLIOGRAPHY


Websites:

http://www.erra.gov.pk
http://www.hec.org
http://www.pesrp.edu.pk
http://www.unesco.org
http://www.unesco.org/education/information/nfsunesco/pdf
http://www.unesco.org/education/pdf/TEACHE_E.PDF
http://www-wds.worldbank.org